

١٩٠. وَقَالَ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ): وَاعْجَبَاهُ! أَتَكُونُ الْخِلَافَةَ بِالصَّحَابَةِ وَلَا تَكُونُ بِالصَّحَابَةِ وَالْقَرَابَةِ؟

190. Amīr al-mu'minīn, peace be upon him, said: How strange? Could the caliphate be through the (Prophet's) companionship but not through (his) companionship and (his) kinship?

قَالَ السَّيِّدُ الرَّضِيُّ: وَرَوَى لَهُ شِعْرٌ فِي هَذَا الْمَعْنَى، وَهُوَ:
فَإِنْ كُنْتَ بِالْشُّورَى مَلِكْتَ أُمُورَهُمْ * فَكَيْفَ بِهَذَا وَالْمَشِيرُونَ غَيْبٌ
وَإِنْ كُنْتَ بِالْقُرْبَى حَجَجْتَ خَصِيمَهُمْ * فَغَيْرِكَ أَوْلَى بِالنَّبِيِّ وَأَقْرَبُ

As-Sayyid ar-Raḍī says: Verses have also been related from Amīr al-mu'minīn on the same matter. They are:-

If you claim to have secured authority by consultation, how did it happen when those to be consulted were absent! If you have scored over your opponents by kinship then someone else has greater right for being nearer to the Holy Prophet.

[1]

Footnote :

[1] Ibn Abi'l-Ḥadīd ('Izzu'd-Dīn 'Abd al-Ḥamīd ibn Hibatul'llāh al-Mu'tazilī [586/1190-655/1257]) says:

“The saying of Amīr al-mu'minīn in the form of prose and poetry was intended for Abū Bakr and 'Umar. In his prose he addressed 'Umar, because when Abū Bakr asked 'Umar (on the day of Saqīfah): 'Give me your hand so that I may swear allegiance to you.' 'Umar replied, 'You are the companion of the Messenger of Allāh in all circumstances — comfort and hardship. So, give me your hand.'”

“Alī, peace be upon him, says (with regard to the claim of 'Umar) that: If you give arguments in favour of the Abū Bakr's deserving the caliphate on the basis of his being the companion of the Holy Prophet in all circumstances, then why did you not hand over the caliphate to one (i.e., Amīr al-mu'minīn) who shares with him (Abū Bakr) in this matter, and who had superiority over him by having a relation of kinship with the Holy Prophet?

“In his poetry, Amīr al-mu'minīn addressed Abū Bakr, because he argued with the anṣār at Saqīfah saying: 'We (the Quraysh) are the kin of the Messenger of Allāh and the seed from which he sprung, (therefore, we are the most deserving people to succeed him).’”

“After allegiance was sworn to Abū Bakr (by a small group at Saqīfah) he used to argue with the Muslims that they must accept his caliphate since it had been accepted by the ahlu'l-ḥalli wa'l-'aqd (the group who can tie and untie a matter — i.e., those who were present at Saqīfah).

“Alī, peace be upon him, says (with regard to the claim of Abū Bakr) that: Regarding your argument with the anṣār that you are from the seed from which the Messenger of Allāh sprung, and one of his tribe, there is other one (i.e. Amīr al-mu'minīn himself) who has the nearest relation of kinship to the Holy Prophet. And concerning your argument that you have been accepted by the consultation of the companions of the Holy Prophet (whom you mean by ahlu'l-ḥalli wa'l-'aqd), how did it happen that most of the companions were absent (on the day of Saqīfah) and did not swear allegiance to you?” (Sharḥ Nahj al-balāghah, vol. 18, p. 416)